

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

ZOLA H, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 2:12-cv-14073

-v-

Hon. Robert H. Cleland  
Magistrate Judge Laurie J. Michelson

RICK SNYDER, et al.,

Defendants.

---

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

By agreement of the parties, for purposes of filing initial motions to dismiss and responses to same or replies to responses, it is hereby ORDERED that:

1. Any individually-identifiable information derived or ascertained from any document produced or other formal or informal disclosure made by a party to this case that concerns any minor child (under 19 years of age), such child's family members, foster family members, adoptive family members, birth family members, and persons included in any case files as a source of information concerning the child, including without limitation any names, addresses, telephone numbers, social security numbers, dates of birth, personal health information or records, including social history records, and other individual information likely to enable a reasonable member of the general public to ascertain the relevant person's identity (collectively, "Individually-Identifiable Information"), is hereby designated to be confidential and shall be subject to the provisions of this Order

2. The use of Individually-Identifiable Information by the parties and their counsel for any purpose other than the preparation and trial of this case or other proceedings related to this case, including but not limited to settlement discussions, is prohibited, except as modified by subsequent order of this Court.

3. Disclosure of Individually-Identifiable Information shall be limited to the parties, their counsel and staff and consultants employed by the parties or their counsel, including testifying experts and persons employed by experts, plus employees, agents, and/or representatives of insurers.

4. Any person to whom Individually-Identifiable Information is disclosed under the terms of this Order shall be provided a copy of this Order and is specifically directed not to reveal such information for any purpose other than as permitted by this Order.

5. If Individually-Identifiable Information is used during depositions or in pleadings, briefs, affidavits or other filings, the relevant portions of deposition transcripts, deposition exhibits, pleadings, briefs, affidavits and other documents shall be treated as confidential in accordance with this Order and redacted or sealed prior to filing.

6. If Individually-Identifiable Information is to be used during trial or in any other evidentiary hearing in this case, the relevant portions of any exhibits, testimony, and other evidentiary submissions shall be treated as confidential and redacted or sealed in a manner consistent with this Order and any subsequent order governing the treatment of Individually-Identifiable Information in this case.

7. Defendants stipulate and agree to this Order without waiving any legal rights or defenses they may possess in relation to opposing Plaintiffs' pending complaint. Plaintiffs

stipulate and agree that they shall not use this Order as a basis for asserting any waiver by Defendants regarding any legal rights or defenses Defendants may possess in relation to opposing Plaintiffs' pending complaint.

8. This Order shall not apply to or prohibit the disclosure or dissemination of information other than Individually-Identifiable Information, including without limitation documents produced by a party to this action that, as redacted or otherwise altered, are not individually-identifiable.

9. This Order is intended to cover documents that the parties may wish to file in connection with their initial motions, responses and replies. It is not intended to identify and cover all documents that require protection that may be requested or produced in discovery.

s/Robert H. Cleland  
United States District Judge

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing document was served upon counsel of record on February 12, 2013, by electronic and/or ordinary mail.

s/Lisa Wagner  
Case Manager

**AGREED TO AND APPROVED FOR ENTRY:**

/s/ David A. Kallman

David A. Kallman (P34200)  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
KALLMAN LEGAL GROUP, PLLC  
5600 W Mount Hope Hwy  
Lansing MI 48917  
517-322-3207  
[dave@kallmanlegal.com](mailto:dave@kallmanlegal.com)

/s/ Joshua S. Smith

Joshua S. Smith (P63349)  
Katherine J. Bennett (P75913)  
Attorneys for Defendants Clinton County  
Dept of Human Services, Genesee County  
Dept of Human Services, St. Clair County  
Dept of Human Services, Ingham County  
Dept of Human Services, Alma Sykes-  
Edwards, Angela M. Wright, Barbara D.  
McElmore, Yvonne (Bonnie) S. Watkins,  
Catherine Hoover, Deborah L. Walbecq,  
Duane Berger, Erin M. Kidd, Felisha  
Dorman, Jennifer Dillard, Joel Brown,  
Kalilah Majied, Kay E. Andrzejak, Linda  
Keller, Martha E. Ballou, Maura Corrigan,  
Melissa Jenniches, Nancy Hill-Leadmon,  
Rebecca Fockler, Rick Snyder, Stacie  
Bowens, Steve J. Yager, Tania H. Allard,  
Timothy Spencer, Veronica Jones, Kumari  
Reynolds, and Latrice Neal  
DEPT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL  
PO Box 30758  
Lansing MI 48909  
517-335-1238  
[smithj46@michigan.gov](mailto:smithj46@michigan.gov)  
[BennettK1@michigan.gov](mailto:BennettK1@michigan.gov)

/s/ James M. Straub

James M. Straub (P21083)  
Sarah J. Hartman (P71458)  
Attorneys for Defendants Ennis Center for  
Children, Inc., Robert E. Ennis,  
and Kristin Varner  
STRAUB SEAMAN & ALLEN, PC  
1014 Main St, PO Box 318  
St Joseph MI 49085  
269-982-1600  
[jstraub@lawssa.com](mailto:jstraub@lawssa.com)  
[shartman@lawssa.com](mailto:shartman@lawssa.com)

/s/ Karen Libertiny Ludden

Richard M. Mitchell (P45257)  
Karen Libertiny Ludden (P48815)  
Attorneys for Defendants Oakland Family  
Services, Michael S. Earl, Naomi Schwartz,  
Rachel Lubetsky, Lisa Westphal  
MADDIN HAUSER WARTELL ROTH &  
HELLER PC  
28400 Northwestern Hwy Fl 3  
Southfield MI 48034  
248-354-4030  
[rmm@maddinhauser.com](mailto:rmm@maddinhauser.com)  
[kludden@maddinhauser.com](mailto:kludden@maddinhauser.com)

/s/ Dennis D. Alberts

Dennis D. Alberts (P26348)  
Attorneys for Defendants Child and Family  
Charities and James Paparella  
OGNE ALBERTS & STUART PC  
1869 E Maple Rd  
Troy MI 48083  
248-362-3707  
[dalberts@oaspc.com](mailto:dalberts@oaspc.com)

/s Karen L. Piper

Thomas Van Dusen (P30602)

Karen L. Piper (P31706)

Attorneys for Defendant Catholic Services of  
Macomb

BODMAN PLC

201 W Big Beaver Rd Ste 500

Troy MI 48084

248-743-6000

[kpiper@bodmanlaw.com](mailto:kpiper@bodmanlaw.com)